The text below is taken from a piece of work submitted by a KS3 student in response to the question: **Is there an external world?** For context, this is their final assignment having studied the course which introduced them to different philosopher’s thoughts and ideas on the subject.

**Which feedback is the best?**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Feedback A | Student Response: | Feedback B |
| Great detail.  Punctuation?  Is it the truth?  This is confusing. Rewrite it so that it makes sense.  There’s a good conclusion in here somewhere. Can you find it? | Neuroscientist Susana Martinez-Conde says “even If your brain knows it is an illusion you still need help to see it”.  Visual illusions can distort our perception so that what we see does not correspond with what is physically there which if your brain can distort things can we actually trust our senses if our brain is so easily tricked should we believe everything we see should we question it.  the truth is our brains are not machines they should be allowed to make mistakes because as Susana Martinez-condo says “Our brain is constantly filling in blanks seeking structure and order even in the cases where it doesn’t exist.”  I believe that the basics are in the external reality like a table is in the external reality, but the colour is not because a colour blind person will see a different colour to what others see, so the brain is using your perception to fill things in so how do we know that the illusions are not true and everything else is fake because a lot of illusions are based on the truth like when my cat died I could and can still sometimes see her walk around or purr, so the illusion is based on something that actually happened, so I believe that the illusion came from the external reality because the cat is there, but the colour is not, so the cat is still there,  so I believe that the illusions come from between the external reality and the physical reality because the external reality says it is there and because of that the physical reality believes it to an extent as well Susana Martinez-condo says experience doesn’t have to match reality and I believe that this is true because our brain does not have to always get it right. | Great use of expert to demonstrate your understanding of their ideas.  What is your main idea or question here? What are your secondary ideas or questions?  You use the word ‘truth’ here – this is a complex concept. You might like to show what other evidence you have to support your argument?  It’s great that you’ve used a personal anecdote here to justify your idea. It reads a little bit like you wrote down exactly what you thought as the ideas were coming to you. What main conclusion did you draw from this thinking? Could you write it in a single sentence?  How does this conclusion help us to answer the question – is there an external world? |